Table of Contents

Chapter 1
Introduction to the Study
1.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................ ........1
1.2 Buoyancy Domain ............................................................................................................. 1
  1.2.1 Formal classroom instruction ..................................................................................1
  1.2.2 Buoyancy-related research ......................................................................................2
  1.2.3 Summary ................................................................................................................ .4
1.3 Computer-Based Learning Environments .........................................................................5
1.4 Qualitative Understanding ..................................................................................................6
1.5 The Aims of the Research ..................................................................................................7
1.6 The Outline of the Thesis ................................................................................................... 7

Chapter 2
Review of Related Literature
2.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................ ........9
2.2 Buoyancy Domain ............................................................................................................. 9
  2.2.1 Framework for buoyancy ........................................................................................9
  2.2.2 Conception of buoyancy .........................................................................................9
  2.2.3 Computer-based modelling for buoyancy.............................................................10
2.3 Foundations of this Research ...........................................................................................12
  2.3.1 Psychological foundation......................................................................................12
  2.3.2 Pedagogical foundation.........................................................................................17
  2.3.3 Related computer-based learning environments ...................................................29
  2.3.4 Relevant human-computer interaction issues........................................................38
2.4 Conclusions................................................................................................................. .....40

Chapter 3
Spring Balance System
3.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................ ......41
3.2 Needs Analysis .............................................................................................................. ...41
  3.2.1 Introduction........................................................................................................... 41
  3.2.2 Preliminary investigation ......................................................................................41
  3.2.3 Conclusions...........................................................................................................43
3.3 System Design and Implementation .................................................................................44
  3.3.1 Introduction........................................................................................................... 44
  3.3.2 Conceptual model of the Spring Balance System .................................................44
  3.3.3 General description of the interface ......................................................................45
  3.3.4 Functionality of the Spring Balance System.........................................................48
  3.3.5 Conclusions...........................................................................................................57
3.4 Formative Evaluation .......................................................................................................57
  3.4.1 Aims ................................................................................................................... ...57
  3.4.2 Expert appraisal ....................................................................................................58
  3.4.3 Pilot test ............................................................................................................. ...58
  3.4.4 Field test ............................................................................................................. ...59
  3.4.5 Results and discussion .........................................................................................62
3.5 Conclusions ................................................................................................................. .....69
7.3 Reasoning Strategies for the Floating Domain.................................................................148
  7.3.1 Fused versus isolated aggregate causal model for the sinking
       and floating domain .....................................................................................................148
  7.3.2 Aggregated bugged student causal model for the sinking and floating domain .153
7.4 Levels of Precision for Causal Reasoning.................................................................153
7.5 Conclusions ...................................................................................................................155

Chapter 8
Change
8.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................................158
8.2 Change in Causal Relationships for BSL ....................................................................158
  8.2.1 Within Questions Stage..........................................................................................158
  8.2.2 Questions Stage to Problem-Solving Stage for Sinking .......................................172
  8.2.3 Questions Stage to Problem-Solving Stage for Floating.......................................172
  8.2.4 Conclusions..........................................................................................................177
8.3 Change in Causal Explanatory Model for BSL ............................................................177
  8.3.1 Completeness of causal explanatory model ..........................................................178
  8.3.2 General observed changes in the causal explanatory model .................................184
8.4 Conclusions ...................................................................................................................185

Chapter 9
Discussion and Conclusions
9.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................................186
9.2 A Summary of Findings ...............................................................................................186
  9.2.1 Articulation ..........................................................................................................186
  9.2.2 Reasoning...............................................................................................................186
  9.2.3 Causal explanatory model ......................................................................................188
  9.2.4 Misconceptions .....................................................................................................188
  9.2.5 Learning .................................................................................................................188
  9.2.6 Summary ...............................................................................................................190
9.3 A Summary of Emergent Issues ...................................................................................190
9.4 Implications ...................................................................................................................191
  9.4.1 Contribution to science learning ............................................................................191
  9.4.2 Contribution to cognitive science research ..............................................................193
  9.4.3 Contribution to qualitative modelling and reasoning research.............................196
  9.4.4 Contribution to the design of computer-based learning environments ...............198
9.5 Summary ......................................................................................................................200

Chapter 10
Critique and Future Work
10.1 Critique of the Research ............................................................................................201
10.2 Future Work.................................................................................................................203
10.3 Conclusions .................................................................................................................206

Bibliography
List of Appendices

Appendix A: 3 questions for PGCE Physics trainee teachers
Appendix B: 4 questions for postgraduate students
Appendix C: An excerpt of the transcript to demonstrate the ‘Similar Problem Different Solution Approach’ and ‘Different Problem Similar Solution Approach’
Appendix D: Pre-test and Post-test Questions for Field Testing Sessions
Appendix E: Worksheet with Pre-treatment Activities
Appendix F: Worksheet with Treatment Activities
Appendix G: Worksheet with Additional Pre-treatment Activities
Appendix H: Worksheet for Experiment
Appendix I: Glossary
Appendix J: An excerpt of transcript for student’s exploration of the BSL System
Appendix K: An extract of coded data for articulation
Appendix L: Tables for total amount of articulation
Appendix M: General rules and equations applied by students
Appendix N: Derived rules and equations applied by students
Appendix O: BSL rule and couples applied by students
Appendix P: Coded data for switch of reasoning strategies
Appendix Q: Details of rules and couples applied by students for floating domain
Appendix R: Process of extracting information for the investigation of the correctness of causal relationships for BSL
Appendix S: Combination of all possible solutions for BSL by applying various rules in the sinking domain
Appendix T: Inference of implicit rules
Appendix U: Change in causal relationships for sinking domain
Appendix V: Summary of rules and couples for floating domain
List of Figures

Chapter 2
Figure 2.1: Buoyancy domain ................................................................. 9
Figure 2.2: Zone of proximal development ................................................ 13
Figure 2.3: ‘Descend’ and ‘ascend’ processes of scientific and spontaneous concepts ........................................ 14
Figure 2.4: Slightly modified Kolb’s experiential learning cycle ................ 15
Figure 2.5: A schematic outline for the process of understanding .......... 19
Figure 2.6: A series of signal icons (adapted from Hollan et al., 1984, p. 121) 31
Figure 2.7: An elementary electrical circuit ............................................. 32
Figure 2.8: A screen display of EM (adapted from Roschelle, 1991, p.5) .... 36

Chapter 3
Figure 3.1: Development process of the Spring Balance System ............ 42
Figure 3.2: Menu structure for the Spring Balance System .................... 46
Figure 3.3: Graph segment icons for the creation of composite graphs ........ 47
Figure 3.4: Various shapes of object ..................................................... 48
Figure 3.5: Overall sequence of student-system interactions for the Spring Balance System .... 49
Figure 3.6: Sequence of necessary actions for running an experiment ........ 50
Figure 3.7: Screen display with no pointer and no graph ....................... 51
Figure 3.8: Screen display with pointer and no graph ............................ 51
Figure 3.9: Screen display for an experiment run with a dynamic (or static) system graph ........ 51
Figure 3.10: Create the starting point by clicking anywhere on the Graph Paper .... 52
Figure 3.11: Screen display after a segment icon is clicked .................... 52
Figure 3.12: A composite graph .......................................................... 52
Figure 3.13: Screen display after first graph modification ....................... 52
Figure 3.14: Screen display after second graph modification .................... 52
Figure 3.15: Screen display after clicking the item Done ......................... 52
Figure 3.16: Qualitative causal reasoning model for Shapes during partial immersion (for sinking situation) ......................................................... 53
Figure 3.17: Qualitative causal reasoning model for the manipulated variable Density of Liquid .......................................................... 55
Figure 3.18: ‘Different Problem and Similar Solution Approach’ .................. 56
Figure 3.19: ‘Similar Problem and Different Solution Approach’ .............. 57
Figure 3.20: Experimental procedures for field tests .............................. 60
Figure 3.21: Student S4’s predicted solution graph for a slanted cylinder, Slant that is lowered form the position shown until it reaches the bottom of the container and subsequently raised out of the liquid to its original position ................................. 63
Figure 3.22: System generated graph for variable Density of Liquid, factor Original and Student S5’s predicted solution graphs for factors Very small and Very great ................................. 63
Figure 3.23: A series of Student Predicted and System Generated Graphs for a BSL user ................................. 67
Figure 3.24: A series of Student Predicted and System Generated Graphs for a non-BSL user . 68
Chapter 4
Figure 4.1: Foundations for the design of the BSL System .......................................................... 72
Figure 4.2: Navigation structure of the BSL System................................................................. 75
Figure 4.3: Laboratory models ................................................................................................. 76
Figure 4.4: The equilibrium of forces model ........................................................................... 76
Figure 4.5: Qualitative graphs ................................................................................................. 77
Figure 4.6: Sequence of students’ interactions in the *Introduction Stage* ........................................ 79
Figure 4.7: Manipulation of B .................................................................................................. 80
Figure 4.8: Manipulation of S .................................................................................................. 81
Figure 4.9: Screen display after manipulation of L manipulation of S ......................................... 81
Figure 4.10: Student’s sequence of actions for sinking situations with 2-D graphs ..................... 83
Figure 4.11: Run an experiment without feedback ................................................................. 83
Figure 4.12: Creation of predicted graphs ............................................................................... 84
Figure 4.13: Student’s sequence of student actions for sinking situations with 1-D graphs ......... 85
Figure 4.14: Sequence of student-system interactions for real problem-solving tasks ............... 86
Figure 4.15: Creation of a problem with a real situation (S>0) ................................................ 87
Figure 4.16: Creation of unreal and modified real target graphs .............................................. 87
Figure 4.17: Manipulation Tool ............................................................................................. 89
Figure 4.18: Problem-solving process for real target graphs .................................................. 89
Figure 4.19: Solution for modified real target graphs ............................................................. 89
Figure 4.20: Generated matched graphs (in white) ................................................................... 89
Figure 4.21: Experiment run for modified real target graphs (with sinking and floating situations) ......................................................................................................................... 90
Figure 4.22: Comparison of real target and matched graphs .................................................... 91

Chapter 5
Figure 5.1: Sequence of events for the treatment session ....................................................... 96
Figure 5.2: Causal effects of the manipulation of *Body Force* on B graph ................................ 97
Figure 5.3: S5’s predicted solution for Task 1 (increase Depth of Submergence) ..................... 99
Figure 5.4: S5’s solutions for the variable Shape (Cone, Sphere, and Slanted Cylinder) relative to the starting block and each other ................................................................. 100
Figure 5.5: S5’s predicted solution for Task F2 (Size) ............................................................. 102
Figure 5.6: S5’s predicted solution for Task F5.1 (Increase Width of Body in a floating situation) ........................................................................................................................................... 103
Figure 5.7: S5’s manipulation of variables for sinking situation (exploration with immediate and direct feedback) .................................................................................................. 104
Figure 5.8: S5’s answers for sinking situations in worksheet .................................................. 106
Figure 5.9: S5’s solution path for problem P1 (sinking situation only) ..................................... 107
Figure 5.10: S5’s solution path for problem P4 (sinking and floating situation) ..................... 109
Figure 5.11: S5’s answers for floating situation in worksheet ................................................ 111

Chapter 6
Figure 6.1: Graphs for the total amount of articulation for students S1-S9 ........................ 114-116
Figure 6.2: Framework for analysis of articulation content ..................................................... 125
Chapter 7
Figure 7.1: Overview of the reasoning strategies ................................................................. 133
Figure 7.2: Interaction between Experiential Reasoning, prior knowledge and BSL .......... 134
Figure 7.3: Interaction between Common-sense Reasoning, prior knowledge and BSL ...... 136
Figure 7.4: Interaction between Scientific Reasoning with general physics rules, prior
knowledge, and BSL ................................................................. 139
Figure 7.5: Interaction between Scientific Reasoning with derived rules, prior knowledge,
and BSL .................................................................................. 142
Figure 7.6: Interaction between BSL Reasoning, prior knowledge, and BSL ................. 144
Figure 7.7: Aggregated bugged student causal model for sinking and floating ............... 123

Chapter 8
Figure 8.1: Related constellations of relevant prior knowledge ........................................ 159
Figure 8.2: Standard causal model for sinking and floating based on constraints in
BSL System ............................................................................. 160
Figure 8.3: Solutions for causal relationships in Questions Stage of the BSL System .... 161-163
Figure 8.4: Types of transformation chain for conception of B ......................................... 165
Figure 8.5: Alternative conception of B .............................................................................. 167
Figure 8.6: A comparison of the solutions for Stage Two and worksheet floating tasks .... 176
Figure 8.7: Tree for BSL ..................................................................................................... 178
Figure 8.8: Graphs for completeness of causal explanatory model .................................. 180-182

Chapter 10
Figure 10.1: Levels of discovery ......................................................................................... 201
Figure 10.2: An example of student’s erroneous predicted graph ................................. 205
List of Tables

Chapter 3
Table 3.1: Use of informal buoyancy-related language ................................................................. 62
Table 3.2: Causal relationships and justifications ........................................................................ 64
Table 3.3: Conception of floating and sinking ............................................................................. 65
Table 3.4: A Comparison of responses to pre-test and post-test probes ........................................ 66

Chapter 4
Table 4.1: Differences between the Spring Balance System and the BSL System ....................... 73
Table 4.2: Articulation-cum-Reflection Tool ............................................................................... 77
Table 4.3: Sinking and floating tasks of the Questions Stage ....................................................... 82

Chapter 5
Table 5.1: Allocation of excerpts ................................................................................................. 95

Chapter 6
Table 6.1: Definitions of various categories of articulation ............................................................ 113
Table 6.2: Peaks of graphs and their causes ................................................................................ 117
Table 6.3: Troughs of graphs and their causes ............................................................................ 123
Table 6.4: Definitions of sub-categories of articulation ............................................................ 124
Table 6.5: Identical Articulation .................................................................................................. 124
Table 6.6: Adapted Articulation .................................................................................................. 127
Table 6.7: Extended Articulation ................................................................................................ 130

Chapter 7
Table 7.1: Definitions of various reasoning strategies ................................................................. 131
Table 7.2: Definitions of various interactional links ..................................................................... 132
Table 7.3: A comparison between the source and target situations ............................................ 135
Table 7.4: A comparison between student common-sense reasoning model and a correct model ................................................................................................................................. 137
Table 7.5: Correct general physics rules .................................................................................... 138
Table 7.6: Switch of reasoning strategies ................................................................................... 146-147
Table 7.7: A summary of rules and BSL couples for the sinking domain ................................. 149-150
Table 7.8: Levels of precision for qualitative reasoning ............................................................ 156-157

Chapter 8
Table 8.1: Causal dependency of S graphs on BL graphs and applied rule (for sinking situations only) ........................................................................................................................................ 168
Table 8.2: Effects of a general bottom area rule on student derived conclusions ....................... 170
Table 8.3: Effects of an incorrect conception of L (as total weight of the liquid column) on student derived conclusions ........................................................................................................................................ 170
Table 8.4: Transformation chains for BSL ................................................................................ 173-174
Table 8.5: Definition for the various levels of completeness and correctness of a causal explanatory model ................................................................................................................................. 179
Table 8.6: Causes of incomplete explanatory model for B ........................................................... 182
Table 8.7: Evaluation of correctness of student complete explanatory model for B .................. 183
Table 8.8: Correctness of student complete explanatory model for S ........................................ 183
Table 8.9: Causes of incomplete explanatory model for L ........................................................ 184

Chapter 9
Table 9.1: Qualitative reasoning with second order derivative .................................................. 197